

**Final Report Of Options For The Best Use Of The Resources To Support
The Mission And Ministry Of The Anglican And Lutheran Church In The
City Of Peterborough**

November 2016

OUR VISION

“We Are a Joyful Presence of God’s Love in Our Community”

OUR MISSION

“We Will Show and Share the Teachings of Christ in All We Do”

***“We Will Reach Inward and Outward to Support One Another,
Spiritually, Emotionally and Physically”***

Covenant Commission Members: Johanna Coombs (Christ Lutheran), Marion Edwards (St. Luke's), Lucinda Hage (St John), Mary Anne Hammond St Barnabas), Lois MacVichie (All Saints'), Geoff Matthews (All Saints'), Amy Milburn (St. Luke's), Ralph Tippet (St John), Peter Tovell (Diocese of Toronto), David Watton, (All Saints'), Raymond Yip Choy (St Barnabas)

Final Report Of Options For The Best Use Of The Resources To Support The Mission And Ministry Of The Anglican And Lutheran Church In The City Of Peterborough, November 2016¹

Recommendation

The Commission respectfully submits to the five Peterborough Anglican-Lutheran parishes and the Diocese of Toronto the following recommended Option:

Reduce The Current Five Parishes To Two, Each With A New Name, Two Governance Structures, Worshiping At Two Locations.

Background

The origin our work was an October 1 2015 letter from the Rt. Rev. Linda Nicholls to all five Anglican-Lutheran parishes in which she noted that “Over the last several years we have sought ways to address the challenges facing each of the congregations in the City of Peterborough. Clergy and lay leaders met with me to think about ways in which the Anglican parishes (later joined by the Christ Lutheran Church) might work together.”

The kind of information that precipitated the Bishop’s letter and subsequent meeting includes:

From 2001 to 2014 combined average Sunday attendance has been reduced from 1,000 to just over 500, an approximate decline of 50% in fourteen years. This trend is characteristic of all five of our current congregations and is continuing (Peterborough is the fifth oldest community in Canada with 40% of the population over 65 years). Givings have increased over that fourteen year period from approximately \$800,000 to \$900,000 but have not kept pace with increased costs. Declining congregation size, combined with increasing costs mean that all of our parishes will become financially unsustainable in the longer term and some are currently unsustainable or will be so in the short or medium term.

In November 2015 the Bishop established the Commission on Peterborough Churches with a Terms of Reference which included a Purpose and related Tasks.

“Purpose: It is clear that our current model of congregational life across five churches is unsustainable in the long term. The commission will:

Task 1: “Review the current assets, resources, mission & ministry of the five congregations in Peterborough City and

Task 2: Propose options for reconfiguration that will best use these resources for the purposes of Anglican/Lutheran ministry in the City of Peterborough.”

¹ The Covenant Commission would like to thank the many members of the Lutheran and Anglican parishes who over the past 8 months took the time to contribute to our work and to discuss our previous documents which included extensive background material and various options for reconfiguration. There has been a wealth of feedback as well as new thoughts that were used to inform our deliberations including the contents of this Final Report.

This Final Report meets the purpose of the Bishop's Commission Terms of Reference and completes its Tasks. Major products include:

- A May 31 2016 Preliminary Options Report consisting of four documents including:
 - the "Preliminary Options Report" itself and three Appendices:
 - Appendix 1 "A Consolidation of the Fiscal, Physical and Staff Resources Available To Commission Churches, Peterborough";
 - Appendix 2 "Mission and Ministry"; and
 - Appendix 3 "Summary of Vision Surveys".
- Following consultation with our parishioners on the May 31 Report, a June 30 2016 "Draft Report of Options" was prepared. This June 30 Report contained two Options for consideration.
- Over the summer and early fall we consulted with our parishioners on the June 30 Report and used those consultations to advise us in the production of an October 19 2016 Draft Final Report.
- The Draft Final Report was discussed and edited at an October 19th Commission meeting resulting in the production of this Final Report (November 2016).

Vision and Mission

Our new combined vision and mission recognizes where we are now and gives us the opportunity to begin the process of renewal. This can be realized, in part, by looking for new ways to reach into the community and support people spiritually, emotionally and physically, not just on Sundays but at times and in places that meet their needs. As we move forward, we need to continue to build partnerships within the community.

We have been challenged to be bold, so let us go forth boldly with the faith that God will lead us. God has already provided what we need. We have been given the opportunity to live our faith giving glory to God whose power in us can do infinitely more than we can ask or imagine.

Major Considerations

In producing this Final Report, the Commission, guided by the comments received from our parishioners and the Commission's deliberations over the past eight months, options for reconfiguration were again reviewed. Some major considerations included:

The Lutheran identity and voice including dedicated Lutheran worship, space and activities must be preserved. In addition, reconfiguration of Peterborough's Anglican/Lutheran resources must also recognise Lutheran differences in governance including church assessment and property ownership.

The outreach activities across all of the churches are extensive and there is a desire to keep a strong outreach presence in the city. The structure of a reconfigured worship community will need to maximize opportunities to work with the surrounding communities.

We heard very clearly that brand new construction would be impractical with long lead times and high cost. We also heard that one physical location would restrict us with respect to the variety of worship and ministries that we are being called to explore.

The Commission has come to a consensus in recognition of a strong general desire by our collective congregations to have a physical presence in the “downtown core” of Peterborough and the more “uptown area” of the city. The Commission therefore does not recommend Option 1 (as identified in the June 30 2016 “Draft Report of Options”: “One Parish with a New Name, One Governance Structure, Worshipping at Two Locations”).

We modified Option 2 of the June 30 2016 “Draft Report of Options”. Specifically:

“Two parishes, each with a new name, two governance structures, worshipping at two or three locations” was changed to:

“Two parishes, each with a new name, two governance structures worshipping at two locations”

The change affects the All Saints', St John part of the Option that stated worshipping would take place at EITHER All Saints' or St John. We recommend that worship take place in one church. Rationale for this change was that we were clear and prescriptive that for purposes of financial viability and logistical efficiency only one of the three "Uptown" churches (Christ Lutheran, St. Barnabas or St Luke's) would be the worship location of that new parish. The same rationale applies to the “Downtown” two churches: only one of All Saints' or St John would be the worship location of that new parish.

The total current combined Sunday attendance for the Peterborough Anglican Lutheran community is approximately 500 people and it is unlikely that all of these would ever be in one place. As we move forward, it is important that we work together to renew the church, not merely restructure it if we are to survive as a faith community in the years to come. As we come to a new understanding of “how we do church”, we need to keep our worship and internal life alive while looking hard at how to meet community needs. Congregations have expressed the desire for several styles of worship that might include Anglican BCP or 8:30 style, traditional (Lutheran/Anglican) or contemporary interactive and flexible style, alternative style as well as ones that we might not even have yet identified.

It is acknowledged that the process of reconfiguration could take two – three years to implement.

Recommended Option

Reduce the current five parishes to two, each with a new name, two governance structures, worshipping at two locations.

Recommendations for Next Steps

Our Recommended Option has implications for additional steps that need to be taken. These steps include consultation with the five parishes regarding acceptance of the Recommended Option and if accepted by the current parishes, steps that need to be taken to implement the Option. Specifically:

1. Following reflection on this Final Report by the five Churches and the Anglican Diocese and Christ Lutheran Church (a member of the ELCIC Eastern Synod), the Diocese and the Lutheran Church consult with the five parishes to seek their “Approvals in Principle” of this Final Report and its Recommended Option.
(Recommended Timeline: November 2016)
2. If Approval in Principle is achieved, the Diocese, in consultation with the Anglican Wardens and the Lutheran Church Council design and initiate an “Implementation Process” that includes but is not limited to:
 - The designation of an Implementation Committee with representation from all five parishes. (Recommended timeline: November 2016)
 - Commissioning of external technical consultant and legal expertise to provide advice to the Implementation Committee regarding the feasibility of the Recommended Option, especially related to its financial, property and logistical components.
(Recommended Timeline: December 2016-January 2017)
3. Development of an “Implementation Strategy” including a recommendation for the use of one of the St John and All Saints’ locations and a recommendation for which one of the Christ Lutheran, St. Barnabas and St Luke’s locations should be used. Timelines for development of the Implementation Strategy should be such that a presentation for acceptance could occur in time for Anglican Vestry and Lutheran Annual Meeting approvals. The Anglican Vestry Meetings and Lutheran Annual Meeting should occur on the same date.
(Recommended Timeline: February 2017).

Note: The Commission acknowledges and appreciates the expertise that the Diocese has related to the above Next Steps and anticipates that financial and technical assistance will be available in the disposition and re-allocation of resources where they are needed for renovations as well as expertise in real estate, planning, congregational development and parish governance.

Detail on the Recommended Option

Two Parishes, Each with a New Name, Two Governance Structures, Worshipping At Two Locations

Parish Structure	Two parishes, each with a new name, two governance structures, worshipping at two locations	
Parish Names	New Name	New Name
Parish Locations	One of: Christ Lutheran St. Barnabas St Luke's	One of: St. John All Saints'
Actions	The Implementation Process would decide on which location to use as well as other elements of reconfiguration.	An Implementation Process would decide on which location to use as well as other elements of reconfiguration.

Note:

We have chosen to use the terms “Uptown Parish” (one of Christ Lutheran, St. Barnabas, St. Luke’s) and “Downtown Parish” (All Saints’/St John).

Option Description

Mission and Ministry

- Revitalizing our Ministry in the community: maintaining two established locations; expanding our programs and outreach to seven days a week.
- There will be two parishes in Peterborough that will honour the traditions of the Evangelical Lutheran and Anglican churches in ways that will allow each parish to pursue expressions of faith that are current, innovative and relevant to the various communities that they serve.
- One parish with one location will continue to serve the local communities that are currently serviced by St John and All Saints’; one parish with one location will focus on the growing parts of the city, continuing to serve the same types of communities that are currently serviced by Christ Lutheran, St. Luke’s and St. Barnabas.
- Each parish will have different personalities which combined, will allow them to serve the widest possible group of worshippers. They will have the capability to not only meet the needs of regular attendees but also those not currently churching as well as the spiritually hungry. This option recognises that there are some differences in the populations served by the uptown and the downtown churches.

- Parishioners from all five Anglican/Lutheran churches will have the option of choosing between two locations and several types of services.
- Spiritual growth and outreach could be undertaken by both parishes. The parish governance structure (clergy, wardens, council) of both parishes could define the specifics and location(s) of mission and ministry for their respective parish. Specialization of existing Lutheran ministry is enhanced.

Physical Resources

- Worship spaces of both parishes could be reconfigured to accommodate traditional and modified worship services, outreach activities and spiritual development.
- Parish governors (clergy, wardens/councils) would coordinate physical improvements consistent with Mission and Ministry. This could include consideration of initiatives such as: the corner at Water and Hunter meeting the housing needs of those we serve; or determining the need for temporary satellite locations to meet program requirements.

Human Resources

- Ministry teams, led by an incumbent including deacons, lay leaders, music directors and community members trained in the different ministries could be formed to lead regular worship services. Other specialised resources could include a Christian counsellor, a spiritual director and parish nurse.
- Two parishes would mean more centralized governance and more operational support structure, less duplication of administrative, maintenance and speciality staff, and more consolidation of offerings and expenses. The two parishes could share resources as appropriate.

Maintenance Costs

- Maintenance costs of two parishes in 2 locations will be less than those for the current five parishes.

Buildings / Building values

- St John - \$9,000,000 insured replacement value of the church buildings plus rental income from buildings located on property owned by the Diocese.
- All Saints - \$10,000,000 insured replacement value of the church buildings plus rental income from buildings located on property and the St Albans site owned by the Diocese, and from the Terraces apartments, owned by the church.
- St Barnabas, Christ Lutheran and St Luke's insured replacement value of the church buildings respectively is \$1,700,000, \$1,000,000 and \$2,500,000 plus rental income from associated buildings.

Clergy and Lay Leadership

- Two city wide parishes, two ministry teams led by two incumbents, including clergy, deacons, lay leaders, music directors and community members trained in the different ministries.
- A potential spiritual growth speciality drawing on existing resources in the church and in the community, e.g. the chaplain at Trent University.
- Speciality team resources shared between the two parishes

Option Assessment By Criteria²

Criterion 1: Vision/Mission Worship

Parishioners, from all five Anglican/Lutheran churches will have the option of choosing between two locations and several types of services. Specifics and location of mission and ministry would be refined by parish governors (clergy, wardens / councils). Ministries could include, but not be limited to; mid-morning/morning worship following the Anglican/Lutheran liturgy (Book of Alternative Services (BAS) / Evangelical Lutheran Worship Book (ELW); Wednesday morning services (BCP); Taize, Open Circle, Messy Church, Fresh Expressions etc.

Criterion 2: Vision/Mission Congregation

Relationships that have developed in individual churches will remain and be enhanced as more people worship together. There will be greater diversity in our churches as we reach into the community in new ways

Criterion 3: Vision/Mission Ministry

Spiritual growth initiatives need to present an opportunity for deepening an individual's relationship with God and one another. This personal experience can be enhanced through: spiritual companionship; offering courses; programs and activities that address the spiritual needs of the community; becoming an extension of the Abraham Festival bringing diversity into a space that already welcomes Buddhists and Catholics.

Outreach initiatives could and do include the Lighthouse Community Outreach program and the Warming Room which operate in partnership with the Canadian Mental Health Association as well as the One Roof Diner. These programs build on existing outreach programs and function as community hubs for people living in the downtown. This ministry provides for many possibilities: a location(s) for people living on the margins; increasing the capacity of people to help one another; providing street and youth activism;

² Nine Criteria used in assessing options in this Report and the options in the Preliminary Options Report (May 30 2016) were developed using feedback from congregations through surveys and town hall meetings/presentations.

encouraging mentoring of youth by seniors; providing daytime respite for mothers with small children and babies; as well as providing the location for an enriched youth group.

The strong music ministry needs to include the continuation of the choir program including the Choral Scholars program. A neighbourhood music ministry could include a community choir of non-traditional singers. Other music ministry would include contemporary and alternate styles.

Ministries such as Pastoral visiting, Refugee sponsorship, Faith Works; Prayer Chains; Chancel guilds; ACW; Sunday school would continue or be enhanced.

Current Outreach Ministries across all churches could continue in any location; These include but are not limited to: Garden Club for low income Youth, Messy Church, Smile dresses, Prison ministry, Cameron House, Food for School kids, Kids Club, Feed the Hungry, Lighthouse tutoring, Community drumming, Collective kitchen, Friday night coffee, Community garden, Food bank, Senior's dinner, Thrift shop, Community dinners.

Criterion 4: Vision/Mission Leadership

Ministry Teams are an effective and efficient way to utilize the expertise and talents within each church. Leaders would be able to work in areas of special interest: worship, outreach, spirituality, teaching, music, etc. as well as provide support to one another and the team. Administrative duties would be centralized. Lay people would be trained to be active listeners, tutors and community connectors to address the needs of, and offer support, to those accessing outreach activities.

Criterion 5: Vision/Mission Facilities

In addition to the worship and outreach space, meeting space and kitchens for congregational and community use at the Downtown Parish, the Uptown Parish would provide permanent facilities in a different part of the city, thereby widening the potential reach of the Church in the city.

The nave in each church would remain but could be re-configured to allow for multiple uses throughout the week: e.g. discussion groups, courses, music outreach, meditation space, etc.

The Uptown Parish facilities along with those of the Downtown Parish will result in enhanced community use, with specific times/locations dedicated for church use. There will be one Property committee and one custodian for each parish.

Criterion 6: Vision/Mission Financial

The total assets of the five Lutheran/Anglican churches are substantial. (Appendix 1)

In addition to total assets, some fundamental current financial information for the combined five churches 2014/2015 is:

Givers:	736
Sunday Attendance:	526
Annual Offerings	\$834,681
Total Income:	\$1,512,714

The relative distribution of the fundamental current financial information identified in Option 1(one parish), broken down relative to the Recommended Option follows:

	Downtown	Uptown
Givers:	57%	43%
Sunday Attendance:	60%	40%
Annual Offerings:	57%	43%
Total Income:	65%	35%

The Downtown Parish would have the consolidated Trust Funds that Include All Saints' Heritage Trust and Doris Fund (for disadvantaged people), and Cornerstone Fund. St. John has substantial investment income and income from rental properties and facilities rental and grants, and All Saints has rental income from the Terraces Apartments and The St Albans property.

The Uptown Parish would have the funds from St. Lukes that include two designated Endowments (interest only) and The Hubbs Estate (interest only). All of the three current Uptown Parishes have rental income and this would continue in some form that would be dictated by the configuration of the facility chosen.

The Downtown Parish and the Uptown Parish would both be financially viable in the medium term.

Criterion 7: Vision/Mission Longer Term Sustainability

Consolidation of churches and the eventual sale of churches will remove any existing deficits.

Our new common vision and mission can be realized by revitalizing the Church, bringing greater engagement of current and lapsed parishioners. It also provides opportunities to build and enhance partnerships within the community: e.g. The City of Peterborough and Canadian Mental Health Association, partner with the Warming Room, Lighthouse program and One Roof Diner. Strong potential exists for new partnerships.

To maintain our financial viability in the longer term, we need to look for new ways to reach into the community and support people spiritually, emotionally and physically, not just on Sundays but at times and in places that meet their needs. Increased costs would be incurred to make the capital improvements needed to consolidate the Uptown Parish. These could be offset by the sale of church properties. The creation of the Uptown Parish maintains a physical church presence in an expanding area of the city.

The Uptown and Downtown parishes would have adequate but currently declining congregation sizes. The Vision and Mission and the reconfigured presence allows us to be

bold and make significant changes in how the Church supports its current members and how it reaches into the community, allowing an opportunity to address the issue of declining congregation sizes.

Criterion 8: Vision/Mission Logistics

Current parishioners have the option of attending several different services in various locations at the time that suits them.

The physical location of St. John's requires creative solutions to the issue of parking. For people living in the St. John's Center it offers easy access to services.

The three Uptown churches are newer buildings with adequate and level parking.

Criterion 9: Implementation Feasibility

Financial

Large trust funds stay in place in the Downtown parish and the Downtown parish will have the greatest capacity for outreach, as well as the highest property values, attendance and weekly offerings.

The existence of two parishes requires remuneration for two incumbents.

Property

The cost incurred to expand accessible parking at the Brock St. entrance of St. John's (approx. \$50,000). St. John's requires a new roof in the next 5 years which will cost approximately \$100,000.

All Saints' requires kitchen stove exhaust renovations in order to continue hosting the Peterborough-wide One Roof Community Diner program. All Saints has a new furnace and Terraces are well maintained, St. John has two commercial grade kitchens; both churches have organs of the highest calibre.

There are costs associated with making Uptown churches accessible.

Renovations that involve capital costs in the redesign of meeting and worship space could be offset by the sale of surplus properties.

Clergy

Two parishes led by two incumbents with support from ministry teams (clergy, deacons, music directors, lay leaders and community members)

Other Staffing

The make-up and direction of the music ministry will have to be redefined to meet worship and mission needs. Administrative and support roles will be consolidated to serve two parishes.

Timing

Implementation of the proposed reconfiguration will take considerable time (2-3 years) due to the decisions that have to be made as to which properties to divest and which properties would need capital improvements..

Communication

A transition team will be put in place. It will include opportunities for people from all churches to come together and get to know one another before any move takes place. Once a decision is made, a Communications Strategy will be developed to assist parishioners with the difficult emotional process ahead.